



Honesty Is the Best Policy?

Claim, Evidence, Reasoning



Shelby Blackwood

Published by K20 Center

This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons CC BY-SA 4.0 License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/)

Grade Level	9th – 11th Grade	Time Frame	120 - 180 minutes
Subject	English/Language Arts	Duration	2-3 class periods

Essential Question

How important is telling the truth? Can you be honest and still be kind?

Summary

Truth is a powerful thing. Sometimes it hurts, and sometimes it is hard to deliver. In this multi-genre lesson, students will analyze and compare three texts written on the subject of honesty. Students will determine the claim a text is arguing and the evidence and reasoning that is used to support that claim. Finally, students will use evidence from the three texts to write and support their own claim. This is a multimodality lesson, which means it includes face-to-face, online, and hybrid versions of the lesson. The attachments also include a downloadable Common Cartridge file, which can be imported into a Learning Management System (LMS) such as Canvas or eKadence. The cartridge includes interactive student activities and teacher's notes.

Snapshot

Engage

Using the Four Corners strategy, students take and argue a position on a stated claim.

Explore

Students analyze and compare the three texts using an It Says, I Say, And So strategy.

Explain

Students watch and summarize a video explaining what it means to make a claim.

Extend

Students state the claim in one of the three texts along with the supporting evidence and reasoning.

Evaluate

Using evidence from the three texts, students state and support their own claim.

Standards

Oklahoma Academic Standards: English Language Arts (Grade 9)

9.3.R.7: Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics, using textual evidence to support their claims and inferences.

9.3.W.3: Compose argumentative essays, reviews, or op-eds that:

- introduce precise, informed claims
- include a defensible thesis
- acknowledge counterclaims or alternate perspectives
- organize claims, counterclaims, and evidence in a logical sequence
- provide the most relevant evidence to develop balanced arguments, using credible sources
- use sentence variety and word choice to create clarity and concision
- use style and tone that suits the audience and purpose

Attachments

- [Argument Sentence Stems and Transitions—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Argument Sentence Stems and Transitions—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Argument Sentence Stems and Transitions—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Argument Sentence Stems and Transitions—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Claim Evidence Reasoning Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Claim Evidence Reasoning Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Claim Evidence Reasoning Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Claim Evidence Reasoning Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Common Cartridge—Honesty is the Best Policy.zip](#)
- [Four Corners Cards—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Four Corners Cards—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Four Corners Cards—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Four Corners Cards—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [It Says I Say And So—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [It Says I Say And So—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [It Says I Say And So—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [It Says I Say And So—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Lesson Slides—Honesty is the Best Policy.pptx](#)
- [Like the Sun—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Like the Sun—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Like the Sun—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Like the Sun—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Tell All the Truth but Tell It Slant—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Tell All the Truth but Tell It Slant—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Tell All the Truth but Tell It Slant—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Tell All the Truth but Tell It Slant—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Why Be Honest—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Why Be Honest—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Why Be Honest—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Why Be Honest—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)

Materials

- Why Be Honest? (copy for each student; attached)
- "Like the Sun" (copy for each student; attached)

<https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/lesson/1469?rev=34420>

- "Tell All the Truth but Tell it Slant" (copy for each student; attached)
- It Says, I Say, And So handout (copy for each student; attached)
- Word Splash Summary Rubric handout (copy for each student; attached)
- Claim, Evidence, Reasoning Rubric handout (copy for each student; attached)
- Argument Sentence Stems handout (copy for each student; attached)
- Four Corners cards (Agree, Strongly Agree, Disagree, Strongly Disagree)
- [Claim, Evidence, Reasoning Video](#)
- Writing Paper
- Pencils

30 minutes

Engage

Teacher's Note

To prepare for this activity, print the **Four Corners cards** and display those on each of your classroom walls. You might consider laminating the cards, so they can be used in other lessons.

Use the attached **Lesson Slides** to follow along with this lesson. Begin with **slide 3**. Read aloud the essential questions: *How important is telling the truth? Can you be honest and still be kind?* Ask students to consider these questions and volunteer their answers. Then, move to **slide 4** and briefly read aloud the lesson objectives. Explain to students they will be analyzing and comparing three different pieces of writing on the subject of telling the truth. They will identify the claims the author makes in the pieces of writing and will write their own claim supported with evidence and reasoning.

Display **slide 5**. Ask students to consider the statement, *"It is important to always tell the truth."* Using the [Four Corners](#) strategy, students move to the sign that designates their feelings about that statement. Allow students time to discuss with others in their group why they made that choice. Students should select a spokesperson to share their thoughts with the other groups. When all groups have shared out, ask students if they have changed their minds after hearing the other groups' reasons. If they have changed their minds, they should move to that sign. Go through the process of discussion one more time.

60 minutes

Explore

Display **slide 6**. Pass out copies of **Like the Sun, Tell all the Truth, but tell it slant**, and **Why Be Honest?** Review the example on the [It Says, I Say, And So](#) **handout** with students. Ask students to read each text and complete the chart as they read. Explain to students they should be reading each text with this question in mind, "Should you always tell the truth?"

Optional differentiation

Consider reading and discussing the texts as a whole class to facilitate differentiation.

Display **slide 7**. When students have completed their charts, ask them to answer this question, "*Have you changed your mind about the statement in the last activity? Why or why not?*" Ask students to discuss their answers with an elbow partner.

30 minutes

Explain

Display **slide 8**. Students view the **Claim, Evidence, and Reasoning video**. Ask students to take notes as they watch the video.

Embedded video

<https://youtube.com/watch?v=JGOxVlgmGWE>

Teacher's Note

Consider viewing the video a second time after students have been given directions for their summary.

Display **slide 9**. Students use the [Word Splash](#) strategy to write a summary of what they learned about claims, evidence, and reasoning. Give students these words to include in their summary:

- Claim
- Evidence
- Reasoning
- Support
- Reliable
- Sources
- Arguable

Teacher's Note

This summary can be used as a formative assessment to gauge student understanding of claims, evidence, and reasoning. A rubric is included in the attachments if you would like to formally assess your students' understanding.

20 minutes

Extend

Display **slide 10**. Ask students to choose one of the three texts they read earlier. They should identify the claim the author made, the evidence the author used to support that claim, and the reasoning the author used to connect the evidence to their claim. They could refer back to their It Says, I Say, And So chart if they need help remembering the texts. When students have the claim, evidence, and reasoning written down, ask them to discuss what they have written with an elbow partner. When they have been given sufficient time to discuss their thoughts, ask for volunteers to share out with the class.

30 minutes

Evaluate

Display **slide 11**. Pass out copies of the attached **Argument Sentence Stems** handout. Ask students to consider this question, *"Should you always tell the truth?"* Explain to students they will now write an argument paragraph stating their position on telling the truth. Revisit the [CER](#) strategy if needed. Students should include a strong, arguable claim, supporting evidence (from the three texts and/or their own lives), and reasoning to connect their evidence to their claim. Direct students' attention to the Argument Sentence Stems handout. Explain these sentence stems could help structure their argument.

Resources

- Beers, K. (2003). *When kids can't read, what teachers can do: A guide for teachers*. Boynton/Cook Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.5860/choice.40-6539>
- Dickinson, E. (1914). Tell all the Truth but tell it slant. *The Poems of Emily Dickinson: Reading Edition*. The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1998. <https://www.poetryfoundation.org/poems/56824/tell-all-the-truth-but-tell-it-slant-1263>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Claim, Evidence, Reasoning (CER). Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/156>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Elbow Partner. Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/116>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Four Corners. Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/138>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Google Classroom. Tech Tools. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/tech-tool/628>
- K20 Center. (n.d.) It Says, I Say, and So. Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/1514>
- K20 Center. (2021, January 27). *Online Discourse Etiquette* [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yPUXQAuhD3E&t=1s>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Padlet. Tech Tools. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/tech-tool/1077>
- K20 Center. (n.d.) Word Splash. Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/199>
- Lickerman, A. (2014, February 24). Why Be Honest? *Psychology Today*. <https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/happiness-in-world/201402/why-be-honest>
- Narayan, R. K. (1985). Like the Sun. *Under the Banyan Tree*. Viking Adult. http://rockwallheums.ss6.sharpschool.com/UserFiles/Servers/Server_125641/File/Frazier/Like%20the%20Sun.pdf
- Shimazaki, S. (2020, October 22). Judges desk with gavel and scales [Photograph]. Pexels. <https://www.pexels.com/photo/judges-desk-with-gavel-and-scales-5669619/>