



# Honesty Is the Best Policy?

## Claim, Evidence, Reasoning



Shelby Blackwood

Published by K20 Center

*This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons CC BY-SA 4.0 License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/)*

<b>Grade Level</b>	9th – 11th Grade	<b>Time Frame</b>	120 - 180 minutes
<b>Subject</b>	English/Language Arts	<b>Duration</b>	2-3 class periods

### Essential Question

How important is telling the truth? Can you be honest and still be kind?

### Summary

Truth is a powerful thing. Sometimes it hurts, and sometimes it is hard to deliver. In this multi-genre lesson, students will analyze and compare three texts written on the subject of honesty. Students will determine the claim a text is arguing and the evidence and reasoning that is used to support that claim. Finally, students will use evidence from the three texts to write and support their own claim. This is a multimodality lesson, which means it includes face-to-face, online, and hybrid versions of the lesson. The attachments also include a downloadable Common Cartridge file, which can be imported into a Learning Management System (LMS) such as Canvas or eKadence. The cartridge includes interactive student activities and teacher's notes.

### Snapshot

#### Engage

Using the Four Corners strategy, students take and argue a position on a stated claim.

#### Explore

Students analyze and compare the three texts using an It Says, I Say, And So strategy.

#### Explain

Students watch and summarize a video explaining what it means to make a claim.

#### Extend

Students state the claim in one of the three texts along with the supporting evidence and reasoning.

#### Evaluate

Using evidence from the three texts, students state and support their own claim.

## Standards

*Oklahoma Academic Standards: English Language Arts (Grade 9)*

**9.3.R.7:** Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics, using textual evidence to support their claims and inferences.

**9.3.W.3:** Compose argumentative essays, reviews, or op-eds that:

- introduce precise, informed claims
- include a defensible thesis
- acknowledge counterclaims or alternate perspectives
- organize claims, counterclaims, and evidence in a logical sequence
- provide the most relevant evidence to develop balanced arguments, using credible sources
- use sentence variety and word choice to create clarity and concision
- use style and tone that suits the audience and purpose

## Attachments

- [Argument Sentence Stems and Transitions—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Argument Sentence Stems and Transitions—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Argument Sentence Stems and Transitions—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Argument Sentence Stems and Transitions—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Claim Evidence Reasoning Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Claim Evidence Reasoning Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Claim Evidence Reasoning Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Claim Evidence Reasoning Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Common Cartridge—Honesty is the Best Policy.zip](#)
- [Four Corners Cards—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Four Corners Cards—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Four Corners Cards—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Four Corners Cards—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [It Says I Say And So—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [It Says I Say And So—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [It Says I Say And So—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [It Says I Say And So—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Lesson Slides—Honesty is the Best Policy.pptx](#)
- [Like the Sun—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Like the Sun—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Like the Sun—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Like the Sun—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Tell All the Truth but Tell It Slant—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Tell All the Truth but Tell It Slant—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Tell All the Truth but Tell It Slant—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Tell All the Truth but Tell It Slant—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Why Be Honest—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Why Be Honest—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Why Be Honest—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Why Be Honest—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)

## Materials

- Common Cartridge (attached)
- Why Be Honest? (copy for each student; attached)

<https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/lesson/1469?rev=34420>

- "Like the Sun" (copy for each student; attached)
- "Tell all the Truth but tell it slant" (copy for each student; attached)
- It Says, I Say, And So handout (copy for each student; attached)
- [Argument Sentence Stems](#) handout (force copy Google Doc)
- [Four Corners](#) cards (Agree, Strongly Agree, Disagree, Strongly Disagree)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric](#) handout (force copy Google Doc)
- [Claim, Evidence, Reasoning Rubric](#) handout (force copy Google Doc)
- [Claim, Evidence, Reasoning Video](#)
- Writing Paper
- Pencils

30 minutes

## Engage (in person)

### Teacher's Note

To prepare for this activity, print the Four Corners cards and display those on each of your classroom walls. You might consider laminating the cards, so they can be used in other lessons.

Use the attached **Lesson Slides** to follow along with this lesson. Begin with **slide 3**. Read aloud the essential questions: *How important is telling the truth? Can you be honest and still be kind?* Ask students to consider these questions and volunteer their answers. Then, move to **slide 4** and briefly read aloud the lesson objectives. Explain to students they will be analyzing and comparing three different pieces of writing on the subject of telling the truth. They will identify the claims the author makes in the pieces of writing and will write their own claim supported with evidence and reasoning.

Display **slide 5**. Ask students to consider the statement, *"It is important to always tell the truth."* Using the **Four Corners strategy**, students move to the sign that designates their feelings about that statement. Allow students time to discuss with others in their group why they made that choice. Students should select a spokesperson to share their thoughts with the other groups. When all groups have shared out, ask students if they have changed their minds after hearing the other groups' reasons. If they have changed their minds, they should move to that sign. Go through the process of discussion one more time.

60 minutes

## Explore (in person)

Display **slide 6**. Pass out copies of **Like the Sun, Tell all the Truth, but tell it slant**, and **Why Be Honest?** Review the example on the **It Says, I Say, And So** chart with students. Ask students to read each text and complete the chart as they read. Explain to students they should be reading each text with this question in mind, "Should you always tell the truth?"

### Optional differentiation:

Consider reading and discussing the texts as a whole class to differentiate instruction.

Display **slide 7**. When students have completed their charts, ask them to answer this question, "*Have you changed your mind about the statement in the last activity? Why or why not?*" Ask students to discuss their answers with an [Elbow Partner](#).

30 minutes

## Explain (virtually)

### Teacher's Note

This assignment has been written to be facilitated with an LMS quiz. If this is not feasible, another option could be to have students complete their summary in a Google Doc and submit it to the LMS or [Google Classroom](#).

In this activity, students watch a video about claims, evidence, and reasoning. They will then use the [Word Splash](#) strategy to write a summary of what they have learned.

To begin this lesson, share the video (linked below) with students. This video may be embedded in an LMS discussion or a link may be shared along with the discussion prompt in a virtual classroom such as Google Classroom.

### Embedded video

<https://youtube.com/watch?v=JGOxVlgmGWE>

Provide the following overview and procedure to students along with the video link.

### Overview:

The three pieces of text you read in the last activity all made arguments about telling the truth. When we make an argument, we are making a claim. Every claim should be supported by evidence and reasoning to connect that evidence to the claim. In this activity, watch the video that describes what a claim is, how to use evidence, and how to use reasoning to get your point across and make a good, solid argument. After you watch the video, write a summary of what you learned about claims, evidence, and reasoning.

Share the following procedure along with the video link with students.

### Procedure:

1. First, watch the Claim, Evidence, Reasoning video.
2. Next, think about what you learned about claims, evidence, and reasoning. Review the video if necessary.
3. Write a short summary (3-5 sentences) about what you learned in the video. Review this [rubric](#) to guide your writing. Use the following words in your summary:
  1. Claim
  2. Evidence
  3. Reasoning
  4. Support
  5. Reliable
  6. Sources
  7. Arguable
4. Click the **Take Quiz** button to begin.

20 minutes

## Extend (in person)

Display **slide 10**. Ask students to choose one of the three texts they read earlier. They should identify the claim the author made, the evidence the author used to support that claim, and the reasoning the author used to connect the evidence to their claim. They could refer back to their **It Says, I Say, And So** chart if they need help remembering the texts. When students have the claim, evidence, and reasoning written down, ask them to discuss what they have written with an elbow partner. When they have been given sufficient time to discuss their thoughts, ask for volunteers to share out with the class.

30 minutes

## Evaluate (virtually)

Students consider the three texts they have read in this lesson and what they say about telling the truth. They will state their own claim, their evidence, and their reasoning about telling the truth in this activity.

Communicate the following overview with students.

### Overview:

In this final activity, you write your own claim about telling the truth. Do you believe you should always tell the truth? Is there a good reason to not be honest at times? What are your reasons for claiming this? Use evidence to support your claim and reasoning to connect that evidence to your claim. Try to use evidence from any or all of the three texts you read in this lesson in your CER (claim, evidence, reasoning).

Next, share the procedure for this activity.

### Procedure:

1. Review this [rubric](#) before beginning your work to ensure you have included all of the things required for the assignment. Refer back to this rubric before you submit your work.
2. Open this [argument sentence stems](#) document. These sentence stems can help you when writing your claim, evidence, and reasoning. Refer back to these often.
3. Open a new Google Doc for this assignment. Thinking about what you've read in the three texts about telling the truth and what your own feelings and experiences are with being honest, write your claim to answer this question: "Should you always tell the truth?" Remember, your claim sentence does not include the reasons, it just states what you believe about the topic. Do not use "I believe," "I think," or "because" in your claim sentence. If you need to review what a claim statement is, refer back to this video.{insert video link}
4. Next, what is your evidence to support your claim? Can you refer to one of the texts you read earlier? Can you use evidence from your own life to support your claim? When you have determined your evidence, write that next.
5. Finally, how will you connect your evidence to your claim? Why does your evidence matter? How does it support your claim? Write your reasoning next in the paragraph.
6. Read through your paragraph. Have you included everything required for the assignment? Does your paragraph make sense? Does it answer the question you were supposed to address? Have you checked for spelling and grammar mistakes?
7. Submit your document.



## Resources

- Beers, K. (2003). *When kids can't read, what teachers can do: A guide for teachers*. Boynton/Cook Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.5860/choice.40-6539>
- Dickinson, E. (1914). Tell all the Truth but tell it slant. *The Poems of Emily Dickinson: Reading Edition*. The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1998. <https://www.poetryfoundation.org/poems/56824/tell-all-the-truth-but-tell-it-slant-1263>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Claim, Evidence, Reasoning (CER). Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/156>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Elbow Partner. Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/116>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Four Corners. Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/138>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Google Classroom. Tech Tools. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/tech-tool/628>
- K20 Center. (n.d.) It Says, I Say, and So. Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/1514>
- K20 Center. (2021, January 27). *Online Discourse Etiquette* [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yPUXQAuhD3E&t=1s>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Padlet. Tech Tools. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/tech-tool/1077>
- K20 Center. (n.d.) Word Splash. Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/199>
- Lickerman, A. (2014, February 24). Why Be Honest? *Psychology Today*. <https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/happiness-in-world/201402/why-be-honest>
- Narayan, R. K. (1985). Like the Sun. *Under the Banyan Tree*. Viking Adult. [http://rockwallheums.ss6.sharpschool.com/UserFiles/Servers/Server\\_125641/File/Frazier/Like%20the%20Sun.pdf](http://rockwallheums.ss6.sharpschool.com/UserFiles/Servers/Server_125641/File/Frazier/Like%20the%20Sun.pdf)
- Shimazaki, S. (2020, October 22). Judges desk with gavel and scales [Photograph]. Pexels. <https://www.pexels.com/photo/judges-desk-with-gavel-and-scales-5669619/>