



# Honesty Is the Best Policy?

## Claim, Evidence, Reasoning



Shelby Blackwood

Published by K20 Center

*This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons CC BY-SA 4.0 License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/)*

<b>Grade Level</b>	9th – 11th Grade	<b>Time Frame</b>	120 - 180 minutes
<b>Subject</b>	English/Language Arts	<b>Duration</b>	2-3 class periods

## Essential Question

How important is telling the truth? Can you be honest and still be kind?

## Summary

Truth is a powerful thing. Sometimes it hurts, and sometimes it is hard to deliver. In this multi-genre lesson, students will analyze and compare three texts written on the subject of honesty. Students will determine the claim a text is arguing and the evidence and reasoning that is used to support that claim. Finally, students will use evidence from the three texts to write and support their own claim. This is a multimodality lesson, which means it includes face-to-face, online, and hybrid versions of the lesson. The attachments also include a downloadable Common Cartridge file, which can be imported into a Learning Management System (LMS) such as Canvas or eKadence. The cartridge includes interactive student activities and teacher's notes.

## Snapshot

### Engage

Using the Four Corners strategy, students take and argue a position on a stated claim.

### Explore

Students analyze and compare the three texts using an It Says, I Say, And So strategy.

### Explain

Students watch and summarize a video explaining what it means to make a claim.

### Extend

Students state the claim in one of the three texts along with the supporting evidence and reasoning.

### Evaluate

Using evidence from the three texts, students state and support their own claim.

## Standards

*ACT College and Career Readiness Standards (6-12)*

**ARG401:** Analyze how one or more sentences in somewhat challenging passages offer reasons for or support a claim

**ARG402:** Identify a clear central claim in somewhat challenging passages

*Oklahoma Academic Standards: English Language Arts (Grade 9)*

**9.3.R.7:** Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics, using textual evidence to support their claims and inferences.

**9.3.W.3:** Compose argumentative essays, reviews, or op-eds that:

- introduce precise, informed claims
- include a defensible thesis
- acknowledge counterclaims or alternate perspectives
- organize claims, counterclaims, and evidence in a logical sequence
- provide the most relevant evidence to develop balanced arguments, using credible sources
- use sentence variety and word choice to create clarity and concision
- use style and tone that suits the audience and purpose

## Attachments

- [Argument Sentence Stems and Transitions—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Argument Sentence Stems and Transitions—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Argument Sentence Stems and Transitions—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Argument Sentence Stems and Transitions—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Claim Evidence Reasoning Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Claim Evidence Reasoning Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Claim Evidence Reasoning Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Claim Evidence Reasoning Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Common Cartridge—Honesty is the Best Policy.zip](#)
- [Four Corners Cards—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Four Corners Cards—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Four Corners Cards—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Four Corners Cards—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [It Says I Say And So—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [It Says I Say And So—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [It Says I Say And So—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [It Says I Say And So—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Lesson Slides—Honesty is the Best Policy.pptx](#)
- [Like the Sun—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Like the Sun—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Like the Sun—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Like the Sun—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Tell All the Truth but Tell It Slant—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Tell All the Truth but Tell It Slant—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Tell All the Truth but Tell It Slant—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Tell All the Truth but Tell It Slant—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Why Be Honest—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Why Be Honest—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Why Be Honest—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Why Be Honest—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.docx](#)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy - Spanish.pdf](#)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy.docx](#)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric—Honesty is the Best Policy.pdf](#)

## Materials

- Common Cartridge (attached)
- [Why Be Honest?](#) (force copy Google Doc)
- ["Like the Sun"](#) (force copy Google Doc)
- ["Tell all the Truth but tell it Slant"](#) (force copy Google Doc)
- [It Says, I Say, And So](#) handout (force copy Google Doc)
- [Argument Sentence Stems](#) handout (force copy Google Doc)
- [Word Splash Summary Rubric](#) handout (force copy Google Doc)
- [Claim, Evidence, Reasoning Rubric](#) handout (force copy Google Doc)
- [Online Discourse Etiquette](#) (video link)
- [Claim, Evidence, Reasoning](#) (video link)
- Writing Paper
- Pencils

20 minutes

## Engage

### Teacher's Note

To prepare for this activity, create a discussion post that allows students to post and reply to one another. This discussion may be facilitated in a learning management system (LMS) such as Canvas or eKadence, or it may be facilitated by creating a question post in Google Classroom or in web applications such as [Padlet](#).

In this activity, students use the [Four Corners](#) strategy to argue and defend their position on a topic. Communicate the following to the students:

**Overview for lesson:** In this series of activities, you will read and evaluate three different texts written on the topic of telling the truth. By the end of this lesson, you will be able to write a claim on your position of telling the truth using evidence and reasoning to support that claim.

Next, share the following activity overview and procedure with students.

**Overview:** Truth is a powerful thing. Sometimes it hurts, and sometimes it is hard to deliver. In this activity, you are asked to respond to a statement about telling the truth. Think about what your first instinct is and how you might respond. Then, consider it more closely and decide whether you agree or disagree with the statement. Make a post on the discussion board commenting on your position and the reason(s) why you chose that position. Finally, comment on your classmates' posts. In order to have a good conversation, try to choose a post from somebody who has the same opinion as you and somebody who has a different opinion as you. Be prepared to defend your position.

### Procedure:

1. Consider this statement: "**It is important to always tell the truth.**"
2. After you have thought about this statement, decide whether you Agree, Strongly Agree, Disagree, or Strongly Disagree.
3. Post your decision on the Discussion Board with your reason(s) why you made that decision. The first word of your post should be what your decision is with a hashtag, for example, #Agree, #StronglyAgree, #Disagree, or #StronglyDisagree. This will help easily identify each others' decisions.
4. Read through your classmates' posts. Try to find at least one classmate who agrees with your position and at least one who disagrees with your position. Did they agree for the same reasons? Have you reconsidered your position after reading the reasons from those who disagree with you? Think about these questions and respond with at least two original thoughts. Remember, "This is cool," or "Awesome!" are not good examples of constructive comments. Consider what you like about a particular post—or perhaps whether it made you consider a new angle. You could start off your comment with something like, "I really like how you..." or "I agree with what you said about (blank) because..."
5. Remember your online discussion etiquette when commenting. If you need a reminder, here is a [short video](#) to help with that.

### Teacher's Note

For information about facilitating an effective online discussion, visit the following link: [K20's Best Practices for Facilitating Online Discussions](#).

60 minutes

## Explore

### Teacher's Note

In Part 1 of the following procedure, students are asked to upload their It Says, I Say, And So chart to turn them in. If using an LMS or virtual classroom, be sure to provide an option for each student to submit their document or to share a link to their file.

It is recommended that you add how you want students to submit their assignment to step 5 of the procedure in Part 1 found below. This may include which file types are acceptable for submissions, a submission deadline, and additional information on how to submit the assignment.

In Part 2, students are asked to submit to and reply on a discussion post. To prepare for this activity, create a discussion post that allows students to post and reply to one another. This discussion may be facilitated in a learning management system (LMS) such as Canvas or eKadence, or it may be facilitated by creating a question post in Google Classroom or in web applications like [Padlet](#).

In this activity, students read a short story, a poem, and an opinion piece. They use a **It Says, I Say, And So** graphic organizer to analyze the text as they read. They then post their overall thoughts about the texts and if they have changed their mind about the statement from the previous activity.

### Provide students with the following overview:

This activity has two parts. First, read three short texts in which the authors have taken a position on telling the truth. As you read through each text, complete the It Says, I Say, And So chart with passages you find in the texts that might answer how each author feels about telling the truth. Next, add your thoughts on those passages and wrap it up with what you can infer or conclude about what the author is saying about telling the truth. When you finish reading the three texts and have completed the It Says, I Say, And So chart, write your overall thoughts on the discussion board.

Next, communicate the following procedure with students:

### Procedure:

#### Part 1:

1. First, open the [It Says, I Say, And So graphic organizer](#). You will complete this as you read each text.
2. Next, open "[Like the Sun](#)." This is a short story about Sekhar, an English teacher in India. Sekhar teaches third form, or ninth grade. In this story, Sekhar conducts an experiment about telling the truth. Think about how the story argues for or against being honest. Don't forget to complete the It Says, I Say, And So chart as you read.
3. When you finish Like the Sun, open "[Tell all the Truth but tell it slant](#)" by Emily Dickinson. Emily Dickinson wrote over 1800 poems from 1858 to 1865. Most of these poems were published after her death in 1890. In her poems, she explored BIG ideas like pain, death, grief, and love. In Tell all the Truth but tell it slant, she explores telling the truth and how it affects people. Read the poem and complete the It Says, I Say, And So chart as you read.
4. For the third piece, open "[Why Be Honest?](#)" by Alex Lickerman. "Why Be Honest?" is an opinion piece on being honest written by Dr. Alex Lickerman for his blog "Happiness in this World" and published in the journal Psychology Today. Complete the It Says, I Say, And So chart as you read through the piece.
5. Submit your It Says, I Say, And So chart when you have completed it.

#### Part 2:

1. Now that you have read and analyzed all three pieces of text, use the following prompts to guide your reflection and post your response on the discussion board:

- What are your overall thoughts on the pieces?
  - What did the pieces have in common or what was different about each one?
  - Have you changed your mind about the statement at the beginning of the lesson, "It is important to always tell the truth?"
2. Click the **Reply** button to create a post.
  3. Once you have posted your thoughts on the discussion board, read your classmates' responses. Are their responses a lot like yours, or are your responses completely different? Why do you think that is? Did they bring up a point you did not consider before? Consider these questions and respond to one or two of your classmates' posts.

30 minutes

# Explain

## Teacher's Note

This assignment has been written to be facilitated with an LMS quiz. If this is not feasible, another option could be to have students complete their summary in a Google Doc and submit to the LMS or Google Classroom.

In this activity, students watch a video about claims, evidence, and reasoning. They will then use the [Word Splash](#) strategy to write a summary of what they have learned.

To begin this lesson, share the video (linked below) with students. This video may be embedded in an LMS discussion or a link may be shared along with the discussion prompt in a virtual classroom such as Google Classroom.

## Embedded video

<https://youtube.com/watch?v=JGOxVlgmGWE>

Provide the following overview and procedure to students along with the video link.

### Overview:

The three pieces of text you read in the last activity all made arguments about telling the truth. When we make an argument, we are making a claim. Every claim should be supported by evidence and reasoning to connect that evidence to the claim. In this activity, watch the video that describes what a claim is, how to use evidence, and how to use reasoning to get your point across and make a good, solid argument. After you watch the video, write a summary of what you learned about claims, evidence, and reasoning.

Share the following procedure along with the video link with students.

### Procedure:

1. First, watch the Claim, Evidence, Reasoning video.
2. Next, think about what you learned about claims, evidence, and reasoning. Review the video if necessary.
3. Write a short summary (3-5 sentences) about what you learned in the video. Review this [Word Splash Summary Rubric](#) to guide your writing. Use the following words in your summary:
  1. Claim
  2. Evidence
  3. Reasoning
  4. Support
  5. Reliable
  6. Sources
  7. Arguable
4. Click the **Take Quiz** button to begin.

30 minutes

## Extend

### Teacher's Note

This activity was configured using the quiz feature in an LMS. If this is not possible, another option could be to have students submit their product as a Google Doc in an LMS or Google Classroom.

Students choose one of the three texts they read in a previous activity. They will write what the author's claim is, what their evidence is, and what their reasoning is connecting the evidence.

To begin the activity, share the following overview with students.

### Overview:

Going back to the three texts you read earlier in this lesson, think about what their claim was about telling the truth. Then, choose one of the three texts for this activity. Write what the author's claim is about telling the truth, what their evidence is to support their claim, and how they use reasoning to connect their evidence to their claim.

Next, share the following procedure with students.

### Procedure:

1. Decide which of the three texts you read earlier you would like to use for this activity.
2. Then, reread the text. Take notes on what the claim is, their evidence that supports the claim, and how they used reasoning to connect the evidence to the claim. You could also revisit the It Says, I Say, And So chart to remind you of what the text said about telling the truth.
3. Finally, click the quiz button to state the claim, evidence, and reasoning from that text.



30 minutes

## Evaluate

Students consider the three texts they have read in this lesson and what they say about telling the truth. They will state their own claim, their evidence, and their reasoning about telling the truth in this activity.

Communicate the following overview with students.

### Overview:

In this final activity, you write your own claim about telling the truth. Do you believe you should always tell the truth? Is there a good reason to not be honest at times? What are your reasons for claiming this? Use evidence to support your claim and reasoning to connect that evidence to your claim. Try to use evidence from any or all of the three texts you read in this lesson in your CER (claim, evidence, reasoning).

Next, share the procedure for this activity.

### Procedure:

1. Review this [rubric](#) before beginning your work to ensure you have included all of the things required for the assignment. Refer back to this rubric before you submit your work.
2. Open this [Argument Sentence Stem Document](#). These sentence stems can help you when writing your claim, evidence, and reasoning. Refer back to these often.
3. Open a new Google Doc for this assignment. Thinking about what you've read in the three texts about telling the truth and what your own feelings and experiences are with being honest, write your claim to answer this question: "Should you always tell the truth?" Remember, your claim sentence does not include the reasons, it just states what you believe about the topic. Do not use "I believe," "I think," or "because" in your claim sentence. If you need to review what a claim statement is, refer back to this video.{insert video link}
4. Next, what is your evidence to support your claim? Can you refer to one of the texts you read earlier? Can you use evidence from your own life to support your claim? When you have determined your evidence, write that next.
5. Finally, how will you connect your evidence to your claim? Why does your evidence matter? How does it support your claim? Write your reasoning next in the paragraph.
6. Read through your paragraph. Have you included everything required for the assignment? Does your paragraph make sense? Does it answer the question you were supposed to address? Have you checked for spelling and grammar mistakes?
7. Submit your document.

## Resources

- Beers, K. (2003). *When kids can't read, what teachers can do: A guide for teachers*. Boynton/Cook Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.5860/choice.40-6539>
- Dickinson, E. (1914). Tell all the Truth but tell it slant. *The Poems of Emily Dickinson: Reading Edition*. The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1998. <https://www.poetryfoundation.org/poems/56824/tell-all-the-truth-but-tell-it-slant-1263>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Claim, Evidence, Reasoning (CER). Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/156>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Elbow Partner. Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/116>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Four Corners. Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/138>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Google Classroom. Tech Tools. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/tech-tool/628>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). It Says, I Say, and So. Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/1514>
- K20 Center. (2021, January 27). *Online Discourse Etiquette* [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yPUXQAuhD3E&t=1s>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Padlet. Tech Tools. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/tech-tool/1077>
- K20 Center. (n.d.). Word Splash. Strategies. <https://learn.k20center.ou.edu/strategy/199>
- Lickerman, A. (2014, February 24). Why Be Honest? *Psychology Today*. <https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/happiness-in-world/201402/why-be-honest>
- Narayan, R. K. (1985). Like the Sun. *Under the Banyan Tree*. Viking Adult. [http://rockwallheums.ss6.sharpschool.com/UserFiles/Servers/Server\\_125641/File/Frazier/Like%20the%20Sun.pdf](http://rockwallheums.ss6.sharpschool.com/UserFiles/Servers/Server_125641/File/Frazier/Like%20the%20Sun.pdf)
- Shimazaki, S. (2020, October 22). Judges desk with gavel and scales [Photograph]. Pexels. <https://www.pexels.com/photo/judges-desk-with-gavel-and-scales-5669619/>